

Traditional and contemporary management strategies applied to coral reefs

**Louise Swanson, Deputy Principal,
Sydney Secondary College, Balmain Campus
GTANSW Councillor**

Evaluate: presenting and defending opinions by making judgments about information, validity of ideas or quality of work based on a set of criteria.

What is a criteria?

A criteria is a set of standards that you use to judge something. For example, students would refer to the criteria to decide how successful the management strategies have been.

An evaluation of management strategies focuses on

the concept of sustainability. The criteria to judge management strategies are:

- Intragenerational equity
- Intergenerational equity
- The precautionary approach
- Biological diversity

What do the criteria mean?

Intragenerational equity	<p>Are people able to benefit from the ecosystem?</p> <p>Are people able to access various part of the ecosystem?</p> <p>Is the present generation of people able to use the resources within the ecosystem? (Consider what use of resources actually means).</p> <p>Is the current population able to benefit from the ecosystem's aesthetic values (the way the ecosystem looks)?</p>
Intergenerational equity	<p>Is the use and management of the ecosystem maintaining the quality of the ecosystem for the future?</p> <p>Will people in the future be able to access various parts of the ecosystem?</p> <p>Will people in the future be able to use the resources of the ecosystem?</p> <p>Is the current population able to benefit from the ecosystem's aesthetic values (the way the ecosystem looks)?</p>
The precautionary approach	<p>Has the ecosystem become more or less susceptible to human or natural stress?</p> <p>Are there attempts to improve knowledge of the threats to the ecosystem?</p> <p>Do management strategies take into account best and worst case scenarios for threats to the ecosystem?</p> <p>Are historical processes maintained (e.g. the ability to adapt to changes)?</p>
Biological diversity	<p>What changes have taken place within food webs/chains?</p> <p>Are there still as many links within the chains and webs?</p> <p>Has the diversity of the ecosystem been diminished in any way?</p> <p>Is genetic diversity maintained?</p> <p>Has there been a reduction or increase of any species? What impact will this have?</p> <p>Is the ecosystem still functioning effectively in terms of biological processes, etc?</p>

EVALUATING

Students need to describe the management strategy, and make a judgement about how effective it is. Use terms such as totally ineffective, somewhat ineffective, moderately effective, very effective. Can you think of some other terms that you could use to describe the effectiveness of a management strategy?

Totally ineffective	Somewhat ineffective	Moderately effective	Very effective
LEAST			MOST
Unsuccessful			Highly Successful
Unproductive			Productive
Impractical			Practical
Useless			Useful
Fruitless			Fruitful
Impractical			Practical
Inadequate			Adequate
Unworkable			Workable



Evaluate extended response scaffold

Evaluate the effectiveness of traditional and contemporary management strategies with reference to ONE Ecosystem at Risk (applied to coral reefs).

Introduction	
Traditional management strategies <i>(you may choose to have a sub-heading)</i>	
Paragraph 1: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describe the management strategy Judgement statement about effectiveness Reference to criteria Evidence to support your judgement 	
Paragraph 2: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describe the management strategy Judgement statement about effectiveness Reference to criteria Evidence to support your judgement 	
<i>Include as many paragraphs as is necessary...</i>	

EVALUATING

Contemporary management strategies *(you may choose to have a sub-heading)*

Paragraph 3 *(the number will depend on how many paragraphs you included on traditional management strategies):*

- Describe the management strategy
- Judgement statement about effectiveness
- Reference to criteria
- Evidence to support your judgement

Paragraph 4 *(again, dependent on the number of previous paragraphs):*

- Describe the management strategy
- Judgement statement about effectiveness
- Reference to criteria
- Evidence to support your judgement

Include as many paragraphs as is necessary...

Conclusion

Writing paragraphs – evaluation

Question: Evaluate traditional and contemporary management strategies applied to coral reefs.

It is important, particularly when you are learning to write responses to have a method or pattern that you follow. In this case the paragraph structure you could use is:

- Describe the management strategy
- Make a judgement statement about the effectiveness of the management strategy
- Refer to the specific criteria that helped you make your decision and explain how it justifies your decision
- Provide evidence to support your judgement

Examine the paragraph below:

Traditional Management Strategies

Totemism

Totemism identifies an individual person with a particular plant or animal species. Individuals are prohibited from killing or eating their totem. Individuals must perform rites (balance or increase/decrease rites) to ensure the continued proliferation of their totemic species. Totemism was a relatively successful means of ensuring that ecosystems remained largely unchanged, through the protection of a collection of individual species. Ecological diversity is maintained because no particular species was targeted by a community as a food source. A variety of different food sources were used by the community to ensure that members of the community are not eating a taboo animal or plant. No one animal or plant was over-hunted. Diamond Stingray, the totem of the Wuthathi tribe in Northern Queensland is abundant in numbers in the eastern Pacific.

Description of the management strategy.

Reference to the criteria.

Judgement statement. Was it effective?

Evidence of the management strategy addressing the criteria.

What are the positives and negatives about this paragraph?

A few ideas have already been written in the table, but write down your own thoughts about the paragraph.

Positives	Negatives
<ul style="list-style-type: none">made reference to the evaluation criteria	<ul style="list-style-type: none">not enough information specifically about coral reefsevidence was limitedused past tense – these practices are still in use today

Now you can begin to write your own paragraph on nomadism and traditional land and sea tenure.

You can see that some sections of the paragraph have already been written for you.

Nomadism and traditional land and sea tenure

Description:

Aborigines did not have permanent settlements, but were nomadic. They had large tribal lands, and clans would move within these boundaries to areas with abundant food and water supply.

Judgement:

.....

.....

.....

.....

Criteria:

This strategy related to intragenerational and intergenerational equity. It addressed intragenerational in that people could make use of the ecosystem as a food source. It also addressed intergenerational equity in that the use of the ecosystem did not hinder or threaten the use of the ecosystem by future generations.

Evidence:

.....

.....

.....

.....

Now it is time to complete the rest of your response without a scaffold in your exercise book/on your laptop.